

**NGO Shadow Report to the Seventh Periodic
Report Submitted by Turkey to CEDAW**

For the 47th Session of CEDAW

July 2016

Prepared by

KADEM

(Women and Democracy Association)

CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION

I. LAW AND LEGAL EQUALITY

II. WOMEN'S EDUCATION

III. PARTICIPATION IN POLITICS AND POLICY-MAKING

IV. WORK LIFE AND WOMEN'S EMPLOYMENT

V. WOMEN'S POVERTY

VI. VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN

VII. WOMEN'S HEALTH

VIII. REFUGEE WOMEN

IX. DISABLED WOMEN

INTRODUCTION

This Shadow Report was prepared by KADEM in connection with the seventh periodic report prepared by Turkey to be submitted to the United Nations CEDAW Committee. In order to study the subject, KADEM formed committees comprised of specialised teams, and brought together the reports issued by each of these committees to create this Shadow Report. The interim report for 2012 submitted by Turkey to the United Nations CEDAW Committee, the seventh term report of 2014, and CEDAW's report entitled "List of Subjects Regarding Turkey's 7th Periodic Country Report" were considered during the preparation of this Shadow Report. In addition to the reports in question considered as main reference sources, a media search was conducted during the process of preparing the Shadow Report, and legislation on the subjects mentioned in the Report were reviewed.

The subjects that are included in the Shadow Report are: law, education, politics and policy-making, employment, poverty, violence against women, health, refugees and disabled women. The condition of women living in Turkey was depicted in connection with each of these subtopics. Three aspects were taken into consideration while ascertaining the condition of women: first, the positive steps taken by the government and concerned actors during the seventh term in connection with each of the subjects were identified and analysed. Second, issues that still prevailed in spite of these positive steps were identified. A larger part of the issues regarding women are deep-rooted problems with sociological, anthropological, political and cultural backgrounds. Expecting such problems to be instantly solved through legal regulations or policies to be followed would require a great deal of optimism. Therefore, the issues that still prevail despite the positive steps taken have been presented in the Shadow Report in detail. Third, action plans addressing steps that must be taken to overcome such problems were considered. Action plans regarding each topic were proposed as a result of rigorous efforts made by specialists commissioned at the KADEM committees.

In a number of topics considered in the Shadow Report, the negative image of women in Turkey is above the world average. For example, Turkey ranks low in respect to participation in politics and decision-making. However, in spite of this, Turkey's performance in the development of higher education, oriented towards engineering and science, and participation in bureaucratic and educational institutions is above some European countries. Therefore, while conducting an evaluation on women, it is important to consider both an objective and constructive attitude. Without a doubt, this attitude will pave the way for politicians and policy makers as well as being encouraging for them.

As KADEM, our wish is that this Shadow Report will serve a constructive purpose and will be functional in this context.

I. LAW AND LEGAL EQUALITY

Related Articles: 1,2,3,4,7,10,11,15,16

Turkey has made significant arrangements to maintain social gender equality under the laws, especially under the constitution in light of international conventions and in line with social dynamics since 2010. Within the process of implementing such regulations, in addition to the international conventions, the demands from the concerned NGOs and social dynamics are also considered. The most significant leg of the arrangements aimed towards ensuring social gender equality is the constitutional changes made.

Turkey has added a provision to the 90th article of the Constitution and kept the international conventions above the Constitution. In cases of conflicts of internal regulations with the international conventions which Turkey is a party to, the idea that the provisions of the international covenants are to be considered as fundamentals were adopted. Turkey has elevated the international norms that envisage social gender equality above the international regulations with the basic rights and freedoms with CEDAW especially with an emphasis on social gender equality. This makes the changes and amendments on internal regulations and legal norms easier and facilitates them. Since 2010, the international conventions have had significant effect on human rights and great steps have been taken towards maintaining social gender equality.

Positive Developments Achieved

Since 2010, Turkey has signed the international conventions executed so as to establish social gender equality and reviewed and upgraded its own regulations to this end. The norms from the Labour Law to the Penal Law that were against women were eliminated from the then applicable regulations and were then replaced with principles that envisage the social gender equality. Significant steps taken in the field of law are essentially as follows:

1. One of the significant steps taken by Turkey relating to the seventh CEDAW period is that on April 2011, it hosted in Istanbul *the Convention for Eliminating Violence against Women and Prevention of Domestic Violence* adopted by the European Commission and executed it. Turkey became the first country to have signed the convention also referred to as the *Istanbul Convention* in relevant literature that expanded the scope of violence in May 2011.
2. Turkey has made a fundamental revision with its nature so as to maintain social gender equality under the constitution. The articles no. 10, 41, 66 and 90 of the Constitution envisage equality of men and women. In 2004, with this amendment made on the 10th article, the provision was added, “women and men have equal rights but the government is responsible for implementing and executing this equality”. In 2010, the expression “the precautions to be taken to this end cannot be interpreted as violation of the equality principle” was added to the article in question and the direction towards affirmative action for women was opened.
3. Article number 41 of the Constitution states, “Family is the foundation of Turkish society” and after that, it was added; “it is based on equality among spouses”. Again, from article number 66, the provision relating to the arrangement of Turkish citizenship encompassing inequality was eliminated.

4. With an amendment made to the Constitution in 2010, the possibility for individual application to the Constitutional Court was opened. The citizens who assume they were subject to victimization of rights may individually apply to the Constitutional Court individually before filing an application before the European Court of Human Rights. In cases of being exposed to gender discrimination, an individual application may be filed to the Constitutional Court.
5. With the Law enacted on June 30, 2012, numbered 6332, the Presidency of Turkish Human Rights Was restructured and the public legal personality was converted into Turkish Human Rights Institution having administrative and fiscal autonomy.
6. In order to ensure that this organization can operate more efficiently, with the Law numbered 6701, in April 2016, the Human Rights and Equality Foundation of Turkey was established. The articles of association of the foundation prohibits all types of discrimination especially based on “gender” and the obligation to prove that discrimination did not occur lies with the counter party. By virtue of this foundation, the target is all public authorities to operate more efficiently in subjects such as human rights, discrimination, and torture and abuse or mistreatment.
7. One of the foundations that envisage fighting against discrimination is the Government Auditing Foundation established in June 2012 with the Law numbered 6328. The lawsuits regarding discrimination and violation of rights based on gender may be considered before this Foundation.
8. With the Law on “Protection of Family and Prevention of Violence against Women” numbered 6284 enacted in March 2012, an important step was taken in the direction of stopping the cases and incidents of violence against women. With this law taking into consideration the provisions of the Istanbul Convention, the definition of violence was re-written and its scope was expanded. In this context, the aim was not only protecting the women who were sufferers of “physical violence” but also women who were victims of “economic and psychological violence” were aimed to be protected.
9. Arrangements were made as per Labour Law nr. 4857 which prevents discrimination. Article 5/1 of the law and sets forth that discrimination cannot be made among employees based on grounds such as “language, race, gender, disability, political thought, philosophical beliefs, religions, religious sects and pregnancy”. The same law envisages that no lower salaries/wages may be paid due to reasons based on gender.
10. An arrangement was made under Labour Law nr. 4857 relating to sexual harassment and this act was prohibited. Again, as per the Code of Obligations numbered 6098, employers are obligated to project employees the obligation was given to the employees for protecting the workers against mobbing and sexual harassment.
11. The Law on the restructuring of some of the “Receivables” enacted in February 2011, numbered 6111 sets forth affirmative action towards providing women with employment opportunities. In case of employing women older than 18 years old of age, it was envisaged that between the 12th and 54th month , the employer’s share of the unemployment part of the insurance premiums were to be covered by the Unemployment Insurance Fund.
12. Again, under Law nr. 6111, the opportunity was given to the workers working on a short term contract basis and working for domestic services for less than 30 days were to be insured under their discretion. Again under law nr. 6552, it was envisaged that the workers working in domestic services be covered under the scope of the social security system.
13. Article nr. 657 of Public Officers Law nr. 108 gives the right to women having given birth and their spouses to take leave without pay of up to 24 months. Again Labour

Law number 4857 sets forth that women working after giving birth may exercise their right of leave without pay for six months.

14. With the law numbered 6552 enacted in September 2014, the scope of birth indebtedness was expanded and the birth indebtedness valid for two children previously was increased to three children. Thus the leaves taken by the insured women for three births may be considered as and used for their retirements.
15. As per the amendments on the article 26 of Law on Unions and Collective Bargaining numbered 6356, it was stipulated that the unions and confederates are to establish equality among their members and not to discriminate among them at all.
16. On March 2014, with the amendment on the Penal Code, the crime for preventing a person from benefiting from “public goods and services” or engaging in any economic activities due to reasons of hate based on “language, race, nationality, color, gender, disability, political thoughts, philosophical beliefs, religions or sects” , such crimes are subject to imprisonment from one to three years.
17. The court decrees open the opportunity for a the divorced woman’s child to use the mother’s surname. The request for giving the child whose custody was given the mother’s surname was found suitable as per the decree of the Constitutional Court dated June 25, 2015.
18. The 10th Development Plan encompassing the period between 2010 and 2018 adopts targets regarding women having equal rights in many fields of society that was organized in various work groups relating to the matter of women. The plan in question aims at taking efficient precautions in terms of prevention of violence against women.
19. Some communiqués promulgated by the Prime Ministry make efforts towards maintaining gender equality in different ways. The Ministry communiqué promulgated in 2011 titled “Prevention of Mobbing at Workplaces is Important” in this context.
20. Another important communiqué to be mentioned in the field of establishing the equality between men and women is the Presidential Decree titled “Increasing Employment of Women and Ensuring Equal Opportunities” numbered 2010/14. As it can be understood from its name, the communiqué envisages the increase of employing women and encouraging women to benefit from equal opportunities.
21. Finally the departments organized under some Ministries so as to perform activities to determine and implement the policies towards gender equality need to be mentioned. The most important organizations to be named in this frame are “Women and Men Equality Unit” operating under the Ministry of Development, “Department of Gender Equality under the Ministry of Labour” and “Social Gender Team” organized under Turkish Statistical Organization.

Ongoing Issues

As it can be seen above, Turkey has taken significant steps towards ensuring social gender equality under the constitution, legal regulations and corporate structuring starting in 2010. However despite these steps, it would be naively optimistic to claim that social gender equality has been efficiently maintained. Some ongoing issues regarding this matter are as follows:

1. At the base of the discriminations, prejudices, templates and attitudes in society towards social discrimination, there are rooted cultural values and in addition to this,

are sociological, economic and psychological values. The improvements made at the legal level may cause the social gender equality to be provided to a certain level and extend accordingly. The activities towards cultural templates and attitudes fail to be effective when not made in coordination (with the law).

2. Some of the legal regulations cannot be executed and implemented in waking life due to the values and morals of bureaucrats, and directors of the executors in general. In brief, the arrangements made in theoretical levels cannot be implemented in the correct direction.
3. The improvement activities regarding employees are operated more efficiently in public organizations in comparison to the private sector. The employees working in the private sector may release/waiver some of their rights due to the fear of being dismissed.
4. Sometimes in the private sector working conditions may be against the employees most of the time. Rights such as annual leaves and birth/maternity leaves provided at the legal aspects, working hours etc cannot be implemented in waking life. The long working hours in the banking sector especially cannot be implemented outside legal sanctions.
5. Despite precautions having been taken against sexual harassment and mobbing in legal terms, it is generally known that such incidents continue in public organizations as well as private sectors. Cases of sexual harassment are often covered up by the victims or the directors of the organization in question.
6. As it was analysed above in detail, social gender equality is adopted as a basic target in the constitution and different legislations. Yet, a certain glass ceiling syndrome continues to exist in both public and private sectors.
7. Women cannot be promoted under equal conditions with men due to the organizational culture, stereotypical ideas and glass ceiling problems due to social networks.
8. While legal arrangements are being made regarding the parties to the subject matter and communication is being made with them and relevant NGOs, in some cases, the requests received from NGOs are not taken into consideration. For instance, when legal arrangements were being made which sets forth the operation of the Human Rights and Equality Foundation, efficient communication with NGOs was not established¹.

Action Plan

As expressed above, there is a considerable difference between legal regulations and the actual implementation. In order to efficiently activate the legal arrangements, strict follow up policies need to be activated. In this scope, some steps need to be taken in the following fields:

1. In order to render the legal arrangements made regarding the social gender equality efficient, the actions and activities regarding the cultural templates and attitudes should also be made in coordination.

¹ For example, regarding the election of the commission members, the requests received from NGOs were not taken into consideration.

2. The units that are to activate legal arrangements need to be re-structured in such a way to meet the aims of the laws encompassed. In addition to this, the executors also need to be trained in this respect.
3. Some incentive mechanisms may be activated so as to ensure that legal arrangements are active in their implementation. In this context, some incentive and award mechanisms that effectively implement and execute legal regulations are of utmost importance.
4. Implementing legal legislations may not be possible in some cases even with incentive and award mechanisms. In this respect, some mechanisms that require sanctions may be activated.
5. Many women are unaware of the rights they were given by law. In this respect, in order to ensure that women are followers of their own rights, they must be informed about awareness activities. The activities in this regard may be performed by means of the relevant public authorities as well as municipalities.
6. Students must be provided with information regarding social gender equality in laws and regulations by placing such matters in the academic curriculum.
7. The publicity principle of the trials must be generalized and the confidentiality of the trials must only be adopted for exceptional cases and for such circumstances, this should be set forth with amendments made under the Code of Civil Procedure.
8. The article nr. 153 of the Code of Civil Procedure that prohibits recording images and sounds during trials can be abolished rendering courts more transparent.
9. The substructure activities to ensure that the trials may be monitored under digital environment and the relevant regulations may be maintained should be implemented and trials should be made where the judge issues a protocol based on his/her own discretion and should gain a transparent view.
10. It is essential that for judges to come out of decision making processes based on personal opinion, political thoughts, social codes and prejudices, the judges and public prosecutors need to be subject to occupational training. With this type of training, the judges should be provided with the capacity to make unbiased and objective decisions.

II. WOMEN'S EDUCATION

Related Articles: 3, 10

In 2012, with Law No. 6287 on Primary Education and the Law on Amendments to Certain Laws, compulsory education was extended from 8 years to 12 years. Girls are the main of this extension. Indeed, previously girls could be disallowed from school after their eight-year education. Now girls will be subjected to compulsory education for 12 years.

The "National Social Gender Equality Action Plan" was prepared for the 2008-2013 term. Maintenance of the "Girls, to School" campaign that was already under way, and the additional implementation of the "Mother and Daughter At School Campaign" were adopted as targets under this action plan.

The concept of gender was not considered under the 9th Development Plan during the 2007-2013 term. The issue of women was not taken as a separate heading, but was considered under the section entitled "Development of the Educational System". The 10th Development Plan covering the following five-year term adopted the goal of forming policies to increase women's education and skill levels in order to create an egalitarian structure in Turkey with respect to women's education.

In line with this plan, updates addressing the development of gender equality in the field of education were initiated through the "National Gender Equality Action Plan" to be brought into force during the 2014-2018 term.

Positive Developments Achieved

Turkey has taken important steps in recent years in the field of education. As a result, important developments in achieving equality between women and men in the field of education were secured. The chief positive developments achieved in this context are:

1. The literacy rate of women has increased through literacy courses provided through the support of both government and non-government organizations. The rate of illiterate women above 25 years of age was 27.4 percent in 2000, and it has now dropped to 9.2 percent in 2014.
2. In recent years, the schooling of girls has increased more rapidly compared to that of boys. The schooling rate for boys of primary school age was 96.2 percent in 2001-2002, and the ratio was 88.4 percent for girls. In 2013-2014, the ratio for boys reached 98.8 percent while the rate for girls reached 99.5 percent.
3. Three factors related to the education of girls may be considered: legal measures, educational support provided to low-income families and the aforementioned implemented reforms. The amendment in Law No. 222 on Primary Education made in 2003, which imposes administrative fines on families failing to send their children to school without a valid excuse despite of a notice served is important in this context.
4. A similar picture can also be seen in secondary education. The ratio of boys studying at secondary school was 53 percent during 2001-2002 while the ratio was 42.9 for girls. However, in the 2013-2014 school years, 94.6 percent of boys of secondary education age and 94.5 percent of girls in the same age group went to secondary school.
5. A similar positive picture is also visible in higher education. While the ratio of men of higher education age studying at higher education institutions was 20.2 in 2001-2002, this ratio was 17.4 percent for women. In 2013-2014, however, the ratio of men

studying at higher education institutions was 38.9 percent while the rate rose to 40.9 percent for women. In short, as a result of the policies pursued or the transformations that took place in social values, the ratio of women studying at higher educational institutions has surpassed that of men.

6. A remarkable increase is observed also in the number of women carrying on with master's and doctoral education. For instance, the ratio of women in master's programmes was 39.6 percent in 2000 and increased to 48.8 percent in 2013, while the ratio of women enrolled in doctoral studies increased from 37 percent to 46.7 percent during the same time span.
7. With the lift of the ban on headscarves in universities, students who were deprived of their right to education were able to regain this right. The ban on headscarves was effectively lifted when the Chairman of the Higher Education Council sent universities a letter on 27 July 2010, informing them that "no student would be expelled from class due to wearing a headscarf." This way, the discrimination against students wearing headscarves, which deprived them of their right to education, was ended.
8. Within the scope of Turkey's targets for 2023 and the 2010-2014 targets prepared by the Ministry of National Education with respect to secondary education, lowering the rate of students discharged or dropping out of school should drop to 5 percent by 2014. This target is above the performance demonstrated by EU countries. The European Union's target for 2020 is to lower the rate of students discharged from school below 10 percent.
9. Conditional Educational Support was implemented to provide educational support for lower-income families as a positive incentive to ensure that women take advantage of educational facilities at an equal level. This aid is directly provided to mothers. The Conditional Educational Support is provided to families on the condition that their children do not drop out of school. Conditional Educational Support has played an important role in girl's education.
10. In Turkey, an increasing interest is observed in women students towards the fields of science and engineering. While the ratio of girls studying at science (oriented) high schools was 43.4 percent in the 2010-2011 school year, this rate increased to 55.4 percent in 2015². While the rate of women students studying at engineering faculties is around 11 percent in the USA, this ratio is 29 percent in Turkey. This, in turn, indicates that women students are increasingly turning to professions that are traditionally more popular with men.
11. In Turkey, the Project on Developing Gender Equality in Education (ETCEP) supported by the EU and the Turkish Government has been implemented since 2015³. Within the scope of this project, gender equality education was conducted on around 500 volunteering teachers and approximately 12 thousand students at 40 schools in 10 pilot provinces between 2015-2016⁴. Within the scope of the project, first teachers and students were subjected to education regarding "gender," then students and parents were given information on breaking sexist stereotypes in girls' choice of profession.
12. Under ETCEP, within the scope of gender equality in schoolbooks, 82 books used in 13 educational programmes were reviewed. The final report prepared by the Revision

² MEB, *National Education Statistics, Formal Education 2010- 2011*, Ankara: MEB 2011; MEB, *National Education Statistics, Formal Education 2015- 2016*, Ankara: MEB, 2016.

³ This project is funded by the EU. A total amount of approximately 12 billion TL shall be expended within the scope of the project. For detailed information, see MEB, *2016 Performance Programme*. For web source, see http://sgb.meb.gov.tr/meb_iys_dosyalar/2016_04/28051255_2016_performans_programi.pdf (Accessed: 23 June 2016)

⁴ These provinces are Trabzon, İzmir, Urfa, Sivas, Erzurum, Batman, Samsun, Mardin, Malatya and Karaman.

Commission, containing the data obtained from the reviews was forwarded to the Ministry of National Education on 13 April 2016.

13. In 2003, Law No. 2923 on "Foreign Language Teaching and Education and Education of Turkish Citizens in Different Languages and Dialects" allowed the teaching of different languages and dialects. Within this context, the previous restrictions of teaching Kurdish, Syriac and Arabic at secondary schools under elective course status were abolished. More advanced steps were taken on this subject at universities. The Institute of Living Languages was founded at Mardin Artuklu University, and Postgraduate education in Kurdish, Syriac and Arabic was initiated. Kurdology departments were opened in the Hakkari, Bingöl and Muş Alparslan Universities.
14. In order to set a standard in gender education at schools, the "Guidelines for Standards on Schools Sensitive Towards Gender Equality" was prepared⁵.
15. The Final Report of the "Work Group for Universities Sensitive to Gender Equality" that convened on 7 May 2015 resolved to include the "gender equality" course in the curriculum as a compulsory course, ensures that gender equality is generally recognised at universities, and instills awareness on gender equality in administrative and academic personnel of universities⁶.

Ongoing Issues

While there have been favourable developments in the above-mentioned areas in the field of education, there are still ongoing serious issues. These issues in the field of education can be listed as follows:

1. Women still constitute a larger part of the illiterate population. While among the illiterate the ratio of men is 1.8 percent, this ratio is 9.2 percent for women⁷. A large percentage of illiterate women is comprised of women living in Eastern and Southeastern Anatolian regions. At the root of this problem lies the fact that many middle aged women and older have no knowledge of the Turkish language, which is the standard language of education.
2. The Basic Law on National Education published in 2013 does not provide compulsory preschool education to children between ages 3 and 5. At a mere 30.8 percent, the rate of children with access to preschool education is below the desired level.
3. Girls' preference of distance education is also considered as a problematic area. During the 2015-2016 school year, 62.6 percent of students studying under distance secondary education were girls. While 45.5 percent of students studying at the open high school were girls in 2010-2011, this ratio has remained at 43.3 percent during the 2015-2016 school year⁸.
4. 57.6 percent of the students starting secondary education in the 2006-2007 school year continued with this school until their graduation. This ratio increased to 76.7 percent in the 2013-2014 school year, and 76.1 percent of girls and 77.2 percent of boys continued with their secondary education until graduation. According to these data, the inclination to drop out of secondary school, although decreasing, is still high.

⁵ See <http://etcep.meb.gov.tr/yerel-toplumsal-seferberlik-kampanyalari-tamamlandi-detayi-1465819664411> (Accessed: 25 June 2016).

⁶ For the Resolution Made at the YÖK (Higher Education Council) Board on the Final Report of the Work Group for Universities Sensitive Towards Gender Equality (29.05.2015), see http://yok.gov.tr/web/guest/anasyfa/-/asset_publisher/MIMLn7g5Y3A/content/toplumsal-cinsiyet-esitligine-duyarl%C4%B1 (Accessed: 24 June 2016).

⁷ TÜİK, *Women in Statistics 2015*, Ankara: TÜİK, 2015.

⁸ MEB, *2010-2011 Statistics on Education*, Ankara: MEB, 2012.

5. The reasons for students dropping out of school are multi-faceted. Personal choice, influence of peers, social judgments, family problems, and problems related to teachers and schools are among these causes. In girls' dropping out of school, along with such factors, the problems of poverty and difficulties in school accessibility-also play a role. The fact that lower-income families are unable to meet schooling expenses or the families are reluctant to send their daughters to distant regions due to an inadequacy of the number of students in rural areas cause girls to break away from secondary education. Another reason for girls to drop out of school is that girls are employed in agricultural work, especially in agricultural regions.
6. According to research conducted by the Ministry of National Education in 2012, the reasons that girls drop out of school were found to be the families' disbelief in the importance of education (56.5%), a large number of children (52.5%), poverty (48%), early marriage (45.9%) and the break-up of families (45.3%)⁹.
7. Among the targets of the Gender Equality National Action Plan for the term of 2008-2013 were ensuring a higher sensitivity towards "gender equality" in educators, educational programmes and materials. It was resolved that within this scope YÖK should include the topic of gender equality in the undergraduate and graduate curriculum of faculties of education. However, there are no indications that this positive resolution was ever put into action. There are no reports or studies prepared by YÖK on this subject.
8. The Ministry of National Education was charged with a heavy burden in the 2008-2013 term and National Gender Equality Action Plan on this matter. However, the number of activities carried out by the Ministry of National Education in line with these targets is small and inadequate.

Action Plans

It is imperative that significant and sustainable policies are developed in order to overcome the ongoing issues in the field of education. Public authority must intervene by carrying out the necessary legal arrangements on the one hand and making efforts in raising awareness on the other. The requests for action requiring development with respect to the subject are particularly the following:

1. Continuing, while increasing the number of, courses addressing illiterate women is important. As mentioned above, such courses develop the interest of women of middle age and over in literacy. It is very important that the number of such courses is increased in the Eastern and Southeastern provinces where the literacy rate among women is low.
2. The issue of preschool education must be taken seriously. In European Union countries, preschool children's rate of participation in education is at the level of 88.4 percent. Preschool education must be rendered compulsory in Turkey, and girls must be enabled to take advantage of this opportunity.
3. In Turkey, compulsory education is 12 years, and is implemented according to the 4+4+4 formula. Although the last 15 years saw a large increase in the ratio of students continuing with secondary education, it is observed that approximately 20 percent of

⁹ In 2012, a research for "Identifying the Educational and Occupational Statuses and Needs of Children Remaining Outside the Formal Education System Due to Grade Repetition and Dropping Out in Secondary Education" was conducted by the Ministry of National Education with the support of UNICEF. Within the scope of the research, questionnaires were held in 15 provinces with 2599 students repeating their grades, 2574 students dropping out of secondary education and 2466 students not attending formal education, and interviews were conducted with 1440 people also including teachers and parents, 480 of which were students.

students fail to continue with formal education. Considering the gender distribution of students failing to continue with secondary education, it is observed that the number of girls is higher compared to boys by 0.9 percent. Although the difference between genders is small, more determined policies must be developed to enable students who fail to continue with their secondary education.

4. School administrations, teachers and directorates of national education must take action in order to prevent girls from dropping out of school, and identifying students risk of dropping out of school to make effective efforts to convince students and parents otherwise. Taking a further step on this subject, it is useful that awareness-raising efforts are made at a national level.
5. Precautions barring early marriage must be taken in order to prevent girls from dropping out of school, while the possibility to marry girls who have not yet reached puberty through their parents' consent must be eliminated.
6. Conditions giving rise to the need to work in fields which causes girls to drop out of secondary school must be eliminated. By helping families under such circumstances or offering flexibility in the term and curriculum of the schools accordingly, girls must be prevented from abandoning their education.
7. Gender stereotypes still exist in higher education. Considering that students graduating from technical departments find employment under better conditions, a more active attitude must be adopted in directing women students towards such departments.
8. Within the scope of the Project for Developing Gender Equality in Education, efforts to identify and remove gender stereotypes in schoolbooks must be increased. Within this context, this subject must be included in the budget of the Ministry of National Education, and a higher level of sensitivity must be shown in carrying out the necessary duties in the next term.
9. In education it is necessary to start work on securing gender equality during the preschool period. Since social stereotypes and value judgments are not fully settled in children's mental world during these ages, any education targeting this period will be more permanent and effective. It is important that education on gender equality is extended from preschool education up to university education. Within this context, the Council of Higher Education (YOK) must carry out the duties it was charged with under the 2008-2013 Gender Equality National Action Plan.
10. It must be ensured that all stakeholders in the education sector, particularly teachers, administrators and parents, receive awareness education concerning gender.
11. Strategic plans implemented at schools must be formed with a focus on gender equality while preparing work programmes and guidance plans.
12. The training provided by bodies within public education, particularly the Public Education Centres, must be restructured in line with the principle of gender equality, and improvements must be made in existing programmes.

III. PARTICIPATION IN POLITICS AND POLICY-MAKING

Related Articles: 3; 7-a,b,c; 8

Participation in politics and policy-making processes, while contributing to the personal development of women, also enables democracy to take root as well as ensuring a diversity in democratic channels and actors, as well as the mobilisation of human resources. Considering the examples in the world, a direct correlation can be seen between the rate of women's taking part in politics and policy-making processes and institutions and the establishment of democracy. Although total equality between women and men has not yet been fully achieved in developed democracies, women are actively included in various levels of politics and policy making-processes and institutions. While political parties constitute one of the important channels for women's participation in political life, it is a fact that other channels also exist. Within this context, professional bodies and non-governmental organisations are also important channels leading to political participation.

There are important international arrangements that ensure women's participation in politics. The *Convention on Women's Political Rights* is an important point of reference in the inclusion of women in politics on an equal standing. Also, the steps CEDAW expects from member states through the World Women's Conferences organised under the leadership of the UN form the important international bases to encourage women's participation in political life.

Pursuant to articles 67, 68 and 70 of the Constitution, Turkish women enjoy equal rights with men in voting and holding office, and founding and joining political parties. Article 83 of the Law on Political Parties provides that all citizens are equal regardless of language, ethnicity, color, gender, faith and religion in membership of political parties. In short, it is seen that national legislation grants women the right to participate in politics at an equal standing with men.

However, in spite of the enactment of international conventions on this subject and the understanding of equality recognised in law, women in Turkey are not represented on an equal footing with men in politics and policy-making processes and institutions. The rate of women's participation in politics and policy-making processes and institutions is below the world average. In spite of a remarkable improvement in Turkey in recent years, ongoing issues still exist.

Positive Developments Achieved

In spite of a negative picture regarding participation in politics and policy-making processes in certain areas, there are also certain positive developments in some areas. These positive developments are listed as follows:

1. An increasing tendency is observed in the number of women members of parliament. Women gained a place in parliament for the first time in Turkey in 1935 with a representation of 4.5 percent. This ratio was never achieved again until 2007. For the first time in the history of the Republic, the 4.5 percent threshold was passed, and the ratio of women in parliament reached 9.1 percent. This ratio rose to 14.4 percent in the 2011 elections and 17 percent in the general elections of June 2015. However, the 1 November 2015 general elections that took place 6 months later saw a decline to 14.7

percent. Barring the election of November 1st, it is observed that the process of women's representation in parliament is in an upward trend.

2. A similar uptrend is also observed in local government. While the ratio of women sitting in provincial councils was 0.9 percent in the 1994 local elections, this ratio rose to 1.6 percent in the 1999 elections, to 2.3 percent in the 2004 elections, to 3.5 percent in the 2009 elections and finally to 4.8 percent in the 2014 local elections. During the same period, the ratio of women in municipal councils was respectively 0.9 percent, 1.4 percent, 1.7 percent, 4.5 percent and finally 10.7 percent in the 2014 elections. According to these data, the rate of increase between the last two elections is over 100 percent. While the ratio of mayors was at the level of 0.5 percent between the 1994 and 2004 elections, this figure rose to 0.6 percent in the 2009 elections and to 2.9 percent in the 2014 elections. Today, three of the 30 metropolitan municipalities are governed by women mayors.
3. The quantitative and qualitative effects in the representation of women at Parliament can be different. Although a small number of women exist at Parliament in Turkey, women have enjoyed high-quality representation by authoring important developments. For instance, women members of parliament played an active role in passing the Civil Law enacted in 2001¹⁰.
4. Discussions regarding quota and parity to ensure a larger place for women in politics have started to enter Turkey's agenda. As a result of these discussions, while HDP (People's Democratic Party) has initiated a quota within its own body, CHP (Republican People's Party) foresaw a 33 percent quota for women by amending its bylaw at its general assembly of 2012. However, this quota was not implemented during the general and local elections held after that date. For instance, the ratio of CHP's woman members of parliament is around 15 percent in 2016. It is important that the quota and parity implementation is discussed in its various facets, and the fact that these discussions have entered Turkey's agenda must be considered a significant development.
5. In recent years, political parties have played an important role in ensuring women's participation in politics. Women have started to actively take place in women's branches of various political parties as well as becoming mobilised by being party members. As of 2014, 49 percent, or half, of AK Party (Justice and Development Party) members were women, whereas 29 percent of CHP members, 25 percent of HDP members and 16 percent of MHP (Nationalist Movement Party) members are women¹¹.
6. In women's branches of political parties, women both show an interest towards social and political life and ensure their personal development by socialising. Both political parties and non-governmental organisations undertake important roles in ensuring that women become more sensitive towards women's issues, developing identity, attachment and awareness in women, gaining experience in projects and obtaining motivation for volunteer work in the field of social responsibility¹².
7. Women actively participate in the activities of non-governmental organisations. During the last twenty years, active women's non-governmental organisations with the power to set the agenda have emerged from among both the secular branches and the

¹⁰ See Ayşe Ayata and Fatma Tütüncü "Critical Acts without a Critical Mass: The Substantive Representation of Women in the Turkish Parliament. *Parliamentary Affairs*, 61 (3), 461–75.

¹¹ KA-DER, *Statistics on Women 2012-2013*, Istanbul: KA-DER. For web source, see <http://ka-der.org.tr/tr-TR/Page/Show/400/kader-istatistikleri.html> (Accessed: 20 June 2016).

¹² Ömer Çaha and Havva Çaha, *Yerelde Tango: Kadın Örgütleri ve Yerel Demokrasi*, Ankara: Orion, 2012, pp. 248-287.

conservative branches of the community. Leading women's non-governmental organisations such as KA-DER (Association for Support of Women Candidates), which focuses on increasing women's interest in politics, AK-DER (Women's Rights Organization Against Discrimination) which focuses on bringing women's rights violations in religious circles to public attention, and KADEM (Women and Democracy Association) which ensures the multi-faceted participation of women in the public sphere and combating injustices to women are subject to attract attention. We observe that a certain amount of sensitivity towards women and the problems of women is developing at the level of both political parties and municipalities. Primarily the women's councils under the City Councils, which come to the fore with their successful activities, have taken on important functions in ensuring the activity of women in social and political spheres.

8. Another positive development that must be highlighted with respect to participation in politics and policy-making processes is the abolishment of the ban on the headscarf. With the abolition –as of October 2013, women members of parliament wearing headscarves were able to take their place in Parliament. This is expected to increase interest in politics among women wearing headscarves.
9. Another positive development for women with regard to participation in politics is the increasingly favourable view, in the eyes of the public, towards women as good administrators and politicians. An important change is occurring in the traditional stereotypes that favour women sitting at home and leaving public activities to men. The opinion that women can be as successful as men at all levels is becoming increasingly widespread in Turkey¹³.

Ongoing Issues

In spite of a positive trend regarding women's participation in politics and policy-making processes and institutions, there still exist ongoing important issues. The issues in question are mainly:

1. The representation of 17 percent, the highest rate in the history of the Republic, which was achieved in the June 2015 general elections, dropped to 14.7 percent five months later, in the November elections. This was caused by party administrators who backgrounded women in the November elections, and listed them at ranks where it would not be possible for them to be elected or removing them from the candidate lists. Both in periods of economic crises and of political crises, women are generally first to be discarded. The November 2015 general elections were held to find a solution to the government crisis caused by the failure of Parliament to form a government. During this process, it was women who were expended. Compared to the elections held in November, the number of women parliament members decreased by 17 percent (from 98 to 81).
2. The ratio of women members of parliament is 14.7 percent as of July 2016. However, according to data published by the Inter Parliamentary Union on 1 May 2016, the ratio of women parliament members around the world is 22.7 percent. Examining the regional ratios of women members of parliament, we come across the following figures: Scandinavian countries at 41.1 percent, America at 27.5 percent, OSCE member European countries at 24.3 percent, Sub-Saharan African countries at 23.1 percent, Asian countries at 19.3 percent, Arab countries at 18.4 percent and Pacific

¹³ Havva Çaha, Sare Aydın and Ömer Çaha, *Değişen Türkiye'de Kadın*, İstanbul: KADEM Yayınları, 2014, pp. 251-286.

countries at 13.5 percent¹⁴. According to these data, the number of women members of parliament in Turkey is lower than the average number for African and Arab countries.

3. A similar adverse picture is also seen in local government councils. For the first time, the total average of the number of women in municipal councils in Turkey rose from 4.5 to 10.7 percent after the 30 March 2014 local elections. The ratio of women mayors rose from 0.9 percent to 2.7 percent. Although significant in itself, this increase is very low compared to world averages. According to data by the institution United Cities and Local Governments, the worldwide ratio for women mayors is 9, while the rate of women's municipal council members is around 21 percent¹⁵.
4. There are women's branches that are very active within parties. The women's branches of certain parties are constantly active rather than only during elections¹⁶. However, despite the fact that women are this active in parties, even forming the load-bearing strength of some parties, they are not very conspicuous in their representation.
5. Women are represented at an almost symbolic level not only in politics, but also in administrative and bureaucratic-policy enforcing processes. The ratio of women civil servants is 36.5 percent. However, only 9.8 percent of this number is commissioned at senior levels. According to research supported by the World Bank, the ratio of women working at hospitals in Turkey in 2015 was 56.4 percent, while those with administrative duties amount to 22.3 percent. According to the same research, while the ratio of women working at schools was 59.2 percent, this ratio was 9.8 percent for administrators. This ratio was 53.5 percent and 23.5, respectively, for women working at banks¹⁷.
6. The existence of women in the higher echelons of bureaucracy is as small as could be considered symbolic. As of January 2015, while there was only 1 woman undersecretary and 1 woman assistant-undersecretary, no women were given the position of director-general. In civil administration, there were only 3 woman governors, 10 deputy-governors and 17 district governors among 2079 civil administrators. Of 229 Ambassadors holding office under the Turkish Foreign Ministry, only 32 are women. A similar picture is also seen at universities. As of January 2015, only 14 universities out of 176 had women rectors.
7. The negative picture presented by public bodies for women can also be seen with respect to professional organisations and non-governmental organisations. No professional organisation in Turkey has a woman president. In fact, most of them have no women on their boards of directors¹⁸. For instance, the board of directors of the Turkish Confederation of Tradesmen and Artisans, the greatest professional organisation in Turkey, does not have a single woman among its 15 members.
8. Unfortunately, trade unions in Turkey have no place for women either. While no trade union has a woman chairman, most of them have no women at all on their boards. There are no women on the boards of the Turkish Confederation of Labour Unions, and only one woman holds office in the 26 members-strong board of directors of the Turkish Confederation of Employers' Associations¹⁹.

¹⁴ Inter Parliamentary Union, *Women in National Parliaments*, [http:// www.ipu. org/ wmn-e/ world.htm](http://www.ipu.org/wmn-e/world.htm) (Accessed: 27 June 2016)

¹⁵ For details see <https://www.uclg.org/en/resources/publications>

¹⁶ See Yeşim Arat *Political Islam in Turkey and Women's Organizations*. Istanbul: TESEV, 1999.

¹⁷ Havva Çaha, Ömer Çaha, Sare Aydın, *Türkiye'de Cam Tavan Sendromu*, Istanbul: KADEM Yayınları (to be published), pp. 49-58.

¹⁸ For a detailed picture on the subject, see Ministry of the Family and Social Policies, Directorate-General on the Status of Women, *Draft National Action Plan on Gender Equality: 2015-2020*, p. 168.

¹⁹ *ibid.*

9. Taking such data into consideration, we see that a distinctive "glass ceiling" syndrome is in place against women. As they climb towards management levels, women are caught in invisible obstacles and remain in lower positions, while higher positions are taken by men. There are certain reasons preventing women from being elevated to higher positions. These reasons may be listed as the patriarchal order, existing stereotypes and prejudices against women, social networks, and the absence of role models.
10. In Turkish society settled stereotypes and prejudices against women are widespread not only among average citizens, but also among intellectuals and artists. The following words spoken by an artist, refer to women in the Eastern and Southeastern Anatolian regions, exemplify the settled judgments within this context: *"I ask you, do you consider it fair for a sister, a mother of ours, who is illiterate and who puts her fingerprint on the ballot instead of signing, to have the same voting rights as an individual who has graduated from 3 different universities? That is not fair. I find this totally unjust. Of course, everyone must be able to vote. Let that sister, who puts her fingerprint, vote for the village headman, while the slightly more educated person can vote for the mayor."*
11. These words spoken by the artist in question is by nature a challenge against legal and political equality, which constitutes the fundamental value of modernity, as well as the concept of equal opportunities. The fact that certain intellectuals and artists in Turkey cannot come to terms with the thought that all citizens are equal regardless of language, religion, faith, gender, education and class, and look down on women, who are included in some of these categories, continues to be a serious problem.

Action Plans

In addition to legal arrangements, a change in cultural point of view and mentality is required for increasing women's representation in politics and policy-making processes. Through determined steps to be taken in this direction, an acceptable level can be achieved in the representation of women. Certain steps to be taken within this context may be listed as:

1. The review of applicable legislation, particularly the Constitution, from the perspective of increasing women's representation. Within this context, increasing women's representation must be targeted by making the necessary amendments in the laws of political parties and elections. In order to increase women's representation in professional organisations and trade unions, amendments to the legislation of such organisations must be made.
2. The necessary arrangements must be carried out to strengthen women's branches of political parties and render them active in the making of the parties' policies. Women's branches must be included in politics and policy-making processes and institutions concerning which policies the parties will pursue, who will be brought to which post, and which woman will be nominated for parliament membership or national and local councils. In order that women's branches are transformed into more active and stronger units, part of the budget set aside for political parties must be assigned to women's branches.
3. Developed democracies have a larger number of channels through which women can participate in local government. The fact that local governments are administrations that are closest to the community, and are organisations that are more accessible compared to national parliaments is an important advantage. Arrangements must be made to render women's assemblies under local governments more active and functional in order to ensure the active participation of women in local decision-

making. Again, the women's assemblies under the city councils must be included in decision-making processes, and must be transformed into active bodies in terms of budget facilities.

4. Arrangements must be carried out to develop women's efficacy in non-governmental organisations. Within this context, it is very important that municipalities have a unit responsible for non-governmental organisations, providing support to the activities of these organisations. The most important problem faced by women's non-governmental organisations is the difficulty of finding a venue. Within this context, it is important that municipalities assign venues for women's non-governmental organisations, assist them in broadcasting their activities and provide vehicle support for their activities.
5. Legislation preventing or complicating women's advancement to senior office at public bodies, embassies and municipalities must be identified and removed. Advancement processes must be regulated regarding women's special circumstances (pregnancy and motherhood) in order to prevent these processes from working against women. It is inevitable that women fall behind in a competitive system that fails to consider women's special circumstances.
6. Women working at public bodies play a "double role" involving their professional duties as well as the responsibility of a family. Since the larger part of the responsibility of housework and raising children continues to fall on women, women fall behind men in the process of advancement. For this reason, women's family responsibilities must be shared with public institutions, such as kindergartens, therefore contributing to their advancement processes.
7. It is important that awareness-raising activities must be carried out in order to develop women's interest in politics. Within this context, female students must be involved in decision-making beginning in primary education. Women students must be given the opportunity to gain leadership experience by ensuring them a more active role especially at students' clubs and students' councils at universities.
8. Parties must maintain activities such as "school of politics" or "academy of politics" addressing all citizens in general and women in particular. Municipalities must allocate resources to such activities in order to educate women on politics. Within this context, fundamental political concepts, processes, approaches, opinions and experience must be shared with women to raise their interest towards politics.

IV. WORK LIFE AND WOMEN’S EMPLOYMENT

Related Articles: 3, 11, 13, 14

With developed legal regulations and policies, Turkey attempts both to prevent women from undergoing discrimination in work life and to encourage the progress of women’s employment. In this regard, significant revisions have been made in laws, primarily in the constitution. With the statement in the Article 50/2 of the Constitution “minors, women and those disabled physically and mentally are protected privately in terms of work” it is guaranteed that women are protected against heavy manual labour such as mines, as well as in cases of pregnancy and birth.

Turkey has discussed this issue comprehensively in the 10th Development Plan covering five years between 2014-2018 in order to apply equality existing in legislation to all fields of life. A title named “Family and Women” was added to the aforementioned Plan and targets related to improvement of working conditions were defined in detail under that title. The followings are aimed in the Plan, concerning improvement of working conditions on an egalitarian basis: enhancing women’s employment; improving their level of education and skills; harmonizing family and working life; extending nursery and daycare services; developing flexible prototypes such as parental leave and raising awareness on budgeting responses to gender mainstreaming.

Turkey took a firm action on women’s economic empowerment and women’s employment by establishing Women 20 as an engagement group of G-20 in September 2015 under G20 Presidency of Turkey . Women 20 has a special importance in respect to show the need for developing separate and special policies and implementations on women’s economic empowerment. In this respect Women 20 which is steered by a committee including KADEM (Women and Democracy Association), KAGIDER (Women Entrepreneurs Association) and TIKAD (Turkish Business Women Association) held 3 important high level meetings during the G20 Presidency of Turkey, and continues to make studies as the founder of Women 20 Engagement Group.

Women are still in disadvantaged situations in work life despite such measures taken in Turkey. By January 2015, the participation rate of women in work life was at a level of 33.3%. This rate was very low compared to other developed countries. According to the World Economic Forum Gender Gap Index, Turkey is ranked as 125th among 142 countries in the course of “general index”, and the 132nd in the category of “economic participation and opportunities”. In spite of steps taken for the improvement of working conditions of women and increasing employment in Turkey, there are still serious problems.

Positive Developments Achieved

1. Intended for increasing women’s employment, the Prime Ministry Circular concerned “Increasing Women Employment and Provision of Equal Opportunities” was entered into force in May 2010. After this Circular, “National Women’s Employment Monitoring and Coordination Board” was established to resolve problems women face in employment. Positive developments on women’s employment will be achieved through the functional efficacy of the Board.
2. The rate of unpaid women workers, which was 49.5% in 2002 dropped to 31% in 2014, while the rate of paid women workers rose up to 56 percent. One of the

significant factors that played a role in this situation was rural-urban migration. Women's work invisible in agriculture began to be visible in urban work environments. It is encouraging for the future that both the urbanization and the rate of paid women workers are increasing.

3. It is seen that the rate of women's participation in the workforce is accelerating alongside the educational level of women in Turkey. By the year 2014, the rate of women's participation in the workforce who have an education lower than high school was 25.8%, those who were high school graduates was 31.9%, and those who have a University graduate education was 71.3%. As the rate of undergraduates soars, it can be expected that women's employment will increase in the future.
4. In order to prevent women from leaving employment after maternity, the opportunity for female civil servants to work part time for a period of two months in the first pregnancy, four months in the second pregnancy and six months in the following pregnancies was provided, by making amendments in the Article 104 of the Law no. 657 in January 2016. This article extended the period by 12 months in case the newborn child was disabled. Article 108 of the Law no. 657 also enables the spouse of a civil servant who gives birth to be given unpaid leave for a period of up to 24 months.
5. For providing gender equality, "Notice of Workplace Danger Class Regarding Occupational Health and Safety" was published in December 2012, by cancelling "the Regulation on Amendment of Heavy and Dangerous Works Regulation" which states that heavy and dangerous labor is prohibited to be worked by women. With this notice, women were encouraged to work in any occupation by increasing occupational health and safety measures. As of now, women are prohibited to work in underground and underwater occupations.
6. With the Labour Law no. 4857, gender based discrimination has been removed. It is envisaged that discrimination against women in special cases such as pregnancy is averted by stating in the Law "Unless obliged by biological or work-related reasons, employer cannot take different action in making work agreement, determining, applying and terminating conditions to any employees directly or indirectly with reference to gender or pregnancy."
7. The Code of Obligations approved in January 2011 considers employers responsible to provide occupational health and safety measures for pregnant, newly given birth and nursing women and to prevent them from facing psychological and gender-based harassment. It can be predicted that it would have a positive role for women's participation in workforce.
8. In order to spread childcare services, the regulation published in 2013 obligates the workplaces which employ 100-150 women to open nursing a room, and those which employ more than 150 women to open a daycare center.
9. "Income Tax Law" numbered 6663 entered into force on 10 February 2016. Article 5 of the Law consider women who are on unpaid leave because of maternity equal with men who leave work because of military service. Thus, women will be able to add the period of maternity leave to their retirement period by means of becoming indebted.
10. By exposing discrimination, women wearing headscarves were banned to work in public institutions for a long time. With the amendment made in legislation in 2013, women wearing headscarves are allowed to work in public institutions. Currently, they can work in any fields apart from restricted ones such as security and justice.
11. In recent years, it has been seen that the number of women employees in some occupations has begun to increase in Turkey. The rate of female ambassadors rose up to 13.9 %, while it was 4.6 in 2000. The rate of public prosecutors is 6.5% in 2014,

while it was 3.5% in 2000. Likewise, the rate of female academics increased to 43% in 2015, while it was 35.9% in 2000.

12. By January 2015, the rate of female academics in Turkish universities is above the European average. Based on data of 2010, the rate of women in high level academic positions in natural sciences is 25.7% in Turkey, while it is 13.7% in European countries. In the same way, the rate of female professors in engineering and technical areas is 19.1% in Turkey, while it is 8 % in European countries. The rate of women among professors is 29%, for associate professors is 34%, and those among instructors is 42.9% in Turkey. By the same date, 26% of judges and public prosecutors working in judiciary involve women.
13. In the *National Employment Strategy*, Turkey has determined that the rate of women's participation in the workforce shall rise to 41% as one of the 2023 targets. Multilateral steps are being taken in order to achieve that. Within this context, the Prime Ministry Notice numbered 2010/14 "Increasing Women Employment and Provision of Equal Opportunities" entering into force in May 2010 contains significant rules concerning the enhancement of socio-economic situations of women. Ministry of Labour and Social Security continues to work on "Labour Market Activation" for increasing women's employment. Likewise, Ministry of Labour and Social Security continues to work on "The Programme for Protection of Family and Dynamic Population Structure" for harmonizing family and work life. We expect these attempts to reflect on women's employment positively.

Ongoing Issues

Apart from steps taken for enhancing working conditions and employment of women as stated above, the other part is indicated in the section "Law and Legal Equality". Although important steps have been taken in legal areas, the problems relating to the position of women in work life still exist. Some of these problems are mentioned as below:

1. The rate of women in work life is 33.3% by January 2015, and the rate of employment is 28.8%. These rates are too low in comparison with EU member countries. The average of women's employment rate in EU member countries (28 countries) is 59.60% in 2014. This rate rises up to 72.5% in Sweden. The case in Sweden results from part time work opportunity provided for women.
2. There are various reasons for the low participation of women in the workforce. Reasons such as socio-cultural structures, women's full responsibility for housework, caring for children, elderly, ill and disabled people, deficiency of institutional and legal mechanisms regarding harmonizing family and work life, low educational level and hard working conditions in labour market can be mentioned in this context. Similarly, reasons such as psychological and sexual harassment in the workplace are the factors effecting women's workforce negatively.
3. A remarkable distance catches attention in the rates of women's participation in the workforce between urban and rural areas. According to data for the year 2013, women's participation in the workforce is 36.7% in rural areas, while it is 23.4% in urban areas. Employment rates are 23.4% in urban and 35% in rural areas. This difference arises from women's participation in agricultural activities in rural areas.
4. There are remarkable differences in women's employment among regions. Western and Eastern Black Sea regions have the highest rates of women's employment. However, Eastern and Southeastern regions are where the rate of women's employment is low. The rate of employed women is 14.2% in the Southeastern Region, while it is 35.8% in the Eastern Black Sea Region.

5. One of the problems about women in the workforce is the case of unregistered employment. The rate of unregistered employment of men is 29.3%, while that of women is 48.4% by the year 2014. Likewise, 87.2% of self employed women and 56.2% of self employed men are unregistered. Unregistered employment makes women's endeavours invisible in the workforce.
6. According to the Article no. 192 of the Civil Code reformed in 2004 in Turkey, women are free to choose and work in any job and occupation they want without getting permission from their spouse. However, this regulation does not function efficiently as women do not know that widely. The rate of recognition of this law is 46.4% in urban areas, and it is 32.1% in rural areas. Large percentage of women thinks that they have to get permission from their spouse in order to start a job. That effects women's participation in the workforce negatively.
7. Despite that it is prohibited legally, a clear discrimination is seen in compensation policies in practice. Income differences are seen between genders in every educational level but it is more common among those with lower educational levels. By 2014, compensation differences between women and men who have primary or lower educational level is 18%. This difference is 17.8% among those who have high school and higher educational levels. The same situation applies to management positions. By 2014, female managers earn an income 6.6% lower than male managers.
8. Although the bans regarding working women who wear the headscarf have been removed, this discrimination still exists in the private sector. Attention is caught especially in promotion processes. In many entities women wearing the headscarf are employed in "back" and "invisible" positions. Women with a headscarf who have a high level education do not have truly equal opportunities for promotion to high positions such as manager, director or CEO. This arises from the discrimination policy applied by the state for a long time leading to stereotyped attitudes towards women with a headscarf in the labour market.
9. According to laws, an employer cannot behave differently to women. In case that women workers file a claim due to gender discrimination, the legislations of the Article numbered 5/6 of Labour Law is applied. This article distributes the *onus probandi* to both parties. Accordingly, the worker is liable to prove the discrimination. Due to the difficulty of providing proof (such as the difficulty to find a witness for the fear of dismissal), women workers are aggrieved.
10. Article no.20 of Labour Law regulating appeal and procedure of termination notice enjoins women to prove that her work agreement has been terminated because of her gender. However, employers give other justifications for the termination of a contract arising in effect from the worker's gender (pregnancy, maternity etc). Women workers suffer from the difficulty to prove that situation.
11. In Turkey, horizontal and vertical disintegration is seen among occupations in terms of gender. Women mostly center on occupations in education, health, finance and telecommunication sectors. However, men focus on more prestigious and income generating occupations (especially management positions).
12. In Turkey, the rate of women employees in the finance sector is higher than that of men's. Nevertheless, women have no opportunity for promotion to management positions in Central Bank regulating monetary policies of the country. In 2000, 1 of the 7 councilors was a woman in the Central Bank and there is no female councilor in the Central Bank in 2014 .

13. A male-dominated structure is seen in judiciary. The rate of female judges was 39.5% in 2000 fell by 36.9% in 2014. This case leads decisions taken even in favour of women in laws to be ignored in practice.
14. The women's rate of taking part in decision making mechanisms falls behind that of men. The rate of women working in the public sector is 36.5% but only 9.8% of them can hold office in high level statues. According to research supported by the World Bank, the female executive rate is 9.8% while the rate of women working in primary and second education is 59.2% throughout Turkey. These rates are 22.3% to 56.4% in hospitals; and 23.5% to 53.5% in banks. Thus, there is a clear "glass ceiling" problem functioning to the detriment of women in work life.

Action Plans

In addition to legislative regulations and policies, some steps to be taken concerning enhancing working conditions of women and their share in employment are important. Within this context, it is substantial to take the following steps in addition to the policies pursued:

1. The steps taken in judiciary in recent years should also be taken for breaking mentality-based prototypes. In this sense, carrying out endeavours to raise awareness for changing gender prototypes preventing women from participating in the workforce is very important. This kind of work can be performed both at educational curriculum levels and through symposiums, conferences, panels, seminars, publications etc. carried out by public institutions, municipalities and non-governmental organizations.
2. Women working in public institutions have a "double role" and liability containing responsibilities about both family and work life. Women fall behind men in work life and promotional processes, as they take the main responsibility for housework and childcare. In this sense, the promotional processes of women should be supported by sharing domestic responsibilities with public institutions, notably by providing daycare centers.
3. Gendered prototypes and prejudices against women play negative roles in women's participation in work life. In respect to this, policies and mechanisms of stimulus regarding organizational culture and employment policies to consider gender equality in institutions and entities should be developed. It is necessary that the related policies be consolidated with legal sanctions and develop an efficient monitoring mechanism.
4. Policies should be developed for resolving problems in relation to the principle "Equal pay for equal work". Sanctions should be applied to the entities who pay women less than men, who performs the same work.
5. It is easier to apply laws developed for providing equality in work life in public institutions rather than the private sector. The private sector is not willing in this concern as the positive rights given to women have a certain cost. Hence, the cost of positive rights given to women should be undertaken by the state.
6. Workplaces employing 150 women are obliged to open a daycare center, so as to develop childcare services preventing women withdrawing from the workforce. However, taking into consideration that small entities having 50 and fewer employees is largely common in the labour market in Turkey, the number 150 is seen to be too high. In this respect, it will be functional that the number 150 be lowered and government provides subsidy support.
7. Women working with social security can benefit from the application of childbearing borrowing according to the Regulation of Social Security and General Health Security numbered 5510. However, women starting to work with social security after

- childbearing cannot benefit from this practice. This situation should be reformed and this right should be vested to women starting to work after childbearing as well.
8. Women working with a lower salary and without social security in nonregistered sectors is a significant issue. Employment should be carried out to include women in the system who works informally.
 9. “Childcare Promotion” should be given to women to be used in childcare in order to prevent their withdrawal from labour markets. An appropriate pattern should be developed for Turkey by examining various “childcare promotion” models across the world.
 10. Policies should be developed to encourage entrepreneurs to open nursery centers, as well as kindergarten and pre-school education centers. It is very important that government activates stimulus packages for development or services in this field.
 11. Municipalities should be encouraged to open childcare centers and kindergartens for poverty-stricken women workers. If necessary, an item should be added to municipal budgets regarding this issue.
 12. Girls should be encouraged to choose professions in line with their ambition and skills, rather than those pursuant to gender roles. To serve this purpose, vocational tendency determinations can be made in early stages of education.
 13. One of the ways that women take place in the workforce is the field of “women entrepreneurship”. Multilateral works should be performed to develop women entrepreneurship. Apart from awareness endeavours, loan and promotion supports should be provided. This concern falls into the remittance of public institutions such as Turkish Employment Agency (İŞKUR) and Small And Medium Industry Development Organization (KOSGEB), municipalities, NGOs and media.
 14. “Women cooperative system” has a significant role in developing women entrepreneurship, women’s inclusion in production processes, gaining work experience and awareness. This model, which was developed by women NGOs in recent years should be encouraged and extended by the government. Such a model will relieve the government’s burden in the process of employment policies.

V. WOMEN'S POVERTY

Related Articles: 1,2,7,10,11,12,13,14

The number of poor women is increasing considerably all over the world, especially in less developed countries. Several reasons contribute to the increase in women's poverty. The main reasons are the difficulties in access to economic opportunities, the rigidity of gender roles, women's failure to attend to the mechanisms of power and decision, and the difficulties in educational accessibility. It is conceptualized as "feminization of poverty" in literature.

Turkey is a country that has solved the problem of absolute poverty. People whose income level is below the average income are considered to be relatively poor. The rate of relatively poor people is 16.9 per cent in Turkey. However, this rate is around 11 per cent in OECD countries.

In the Ministry of Family and Social Policies' Strategic Plan for the period between 2013-2017, it is intended to prevent the formation of long-term cycles of poverty. Also, it aimed to increase both the ratio of GNP with social institutions and the amount of donation per family. Tackling poverty in Turkey is a multifaceted process. Some of the steps taken in this regard are social institutions, educational assistance, vocational courses, and women's schooling and employment policies. Despite such policies, poverty continues to be a major social problem in Turkey.

Positive Developments Achieved

Poverty still exists as a social problem in Turkey, but considerably positive steps have been taken to eliminate it. The steps are outlined below:

1. In the last decade, donations given to the poor have increased in Turkey. A 144 Social Hotline has been established to easily reach poorer communities. The hotline attempts to cover the demands.
2. Regularly given donations to conditional educational assistance, conditional health assistance and conditional pregnancy assistance are on the rise. In addition, widowed women have been given regular assistance. These payments are deposited directly to their accounts. The number of families who benefit from these payments increased from 239,276 in 2012 to 300,422 in 2014.
3. To cover some aspects of maternity care in poorer communities, a "maternity benefit" is granted to them. According to the 4th adjuvant of the 633 Law No in the 2015, 300 TL is given to women for the first birth, 400 TL is given to women for the second birth and 600 TL is given for the following birth.
4. Children also benefit from the program and are granted regular health checks. In 2015, girls constituted 39.3 percent of children who benefit from the conditional health donation. The amount of support is 35 TL for each child. While the amount is little, it is by no means negligible.
5. Poor pregnant women are given the support of 35 TL per month to provide regular exams during their pregnancy. In case of a hospital birth, the amount given is 75 TL per woman.
6. Under the No. 2022 "Over the age of 65, Needy, Poor and Homeless for Turkish Citizens Law on Income Replacement", elderly people who have no income from the social security institutions are given 203 TL for support.
7. Under income generating projects, poor families are supported up to 15 thousand TL. The conditions are a two year loan, to be repaid within 6 years interest free.
8. The proportion of elderly women who benefit from pensions, such as widows and

orphan's pensions, is more than the proportion to men. In this case, the proportion of men is 75.5 per cent and the proportion of women is 84.3 per cent.

9. In the field of tackling poverty in Turkey, non-governmental organization's incentives are a positive development. Because of this, many non-governmental organizations developed in the last three decades.

Ongoing Issues

However, despite government and non-governmental relief efforts, poverty, especially amongst the female population, persists. Aspects of the problem are as follows:

1. Poverty amongst women has risen in Turkey. In 2009, the poverty rate was 17.1 percent in men, and 19 percent in women. In 2014, the proportion of poor men to poor women was 21.4 per to 22.2' per cent respectively.
2. The poverty rate is higher in women who live in rural areas. Between 2002-2009 rural males poverty increased to 37.1 percent from 34.0 percent while women increased to 40.2 percent from 34.9 percent.
3. There is an inverse relationship between poverty and education levels. Therefore, when the level of education increases, the poverty rate decreases. In Turkey, illiterate women face a greater risk of poverty.
4. In the past decade, Turkey has made great strides in protecting the population from an informal economy. The size of the informal economy was 52.14 percent in 2002. It declined to 32.1 percent in February 2016. However, the unregistered economy still continues to be a problem in the agricultural sector. Between 2002-2016, the unregistered employment rate in the agricultural sector has only dropped to 81.3 percent from 90.1 percent. The informal economy is a grievance, especially to lesser educated women.
5. In the non-agricultural private sector, women generally work in textiles, garments, food and tobacco sectors, which are labour-intensive but low-income.
6. The most important factor that leads to an informal economy is the distribution of small businesses. Small businesses are often excluded from many regulations. Because of the difficulties in the supervision of small businesses, there are no detailed data for documenting how the women working under informal employment are affected.
7. Under the scope of regular financial aid, widowed women are given 500 TL every two months according to the data of 2015. It is clear that this figure is lower when an improvement in lifestyle is marked.

Action Plans

In addition to executed policies implemented to tackle women's poverty, the following steps are important:

1. The encouraging policies should be developed to increase the educational level of women and to encourage their participation in employment.
2. If the level of education increases, the risk of being poor decreases. The implementation of developmental policies regarding women's higher education should be thorough.
3. The amount of social assistance which is given to women should be increased and should at least equate to a minimum wage income.
4. Poor women should be provided credit from KOSGEB (Small and Medium Industry Development Organization). Credit support from KOSGEB at the start of a business

is crucial. Current support is given following the three to four months after the company's establishment.

5. Courses should be expanded for poverty stricken women to pursue a career. Vocational courses for poor women must be an obligatory provision for municipalities.
6. Poor, disabled and elderly women must be informed about aid provided by the state.
7. To better operate conditional support systems more effectively, relevant institutions and organizations should improve cooperation.
8. Municipalities and civil society organizations, as well as the State must also take an active role in developmental policies directed towards alleviating poverty.
9. Studies must be completed about the causes that lead to women's unregistered employment and policies should be developed for the prevention of unregistered work.
10. There are sharp differences between regions in many areas in Turkey, particularly in income distribution. Women's policies for the elimination of regional disparities in poverty should be produced and implemented.
11. According to the EU, Turkey's labour force is unproductive. Employee productivity incentive should be raised in accordance with a wage raise.

VI. VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN

Related Articles: 2-e,f; 3; 5-a,b; 16-1a, 1b; 2

Violence against women is a global problem including physical, sexual, psychological, exclusionary, and deprivation dimensions. Violence against women is experienced within different dimensions and with varying intensities both in developing and developed countries. Recently the topic of violence has been occupying the agendas of International institutions. A long awaited convention about violence against women and domestic was signed in Istanbul in 2011 by the European Council. This convention, known as the “Istanbul Convention” has called attention to different dimensions of violence against women and proposed important preventions and sanctions. Turkey hosted the Istanbul Convention and was the first signatory country.

Violence against women has been intensely occupying the agendas of both nongovernmental organizations and the media as well as the government. Publicized women’s murders have mobilized both the state and nongovernmental institutions. The state has been taking considerable steps with multidimensional policies. The fundamental changes on the 4320 numbered Law on Family Protection and the resulting 6284 numbered Law on Family Protection and Prevention of Violence against Women is first among these steps. The Law was prepared in cooperation with nongovernmental organizations, bar associations and judiciary members and was put into effect with unanimous Parliamentary approval in March 2012. The enforcement of the law ushered in a great flight struggle toward violence against women. Women’s nongovernmental organizations have been participating in this struggle by raising awareness among women and the public, supporting the victims or by campaigning on the subject matter.

Positive Developments Achieved

Awareness about violence against women is rising at state, nongovernmental organizations and society levels. As a result of this sensitivity, considerable positive steps are taken related to the topic. Some positive steps taken can be summarized as follows:

1. The most important measures taken against violence directed towards women is the 6284 numbered law mentioned above. The aforementioned act drew attention to the physical, verbal, sexual, economic and psychological dimensions of violence by expanding the scope of the concept of violence. Besides this, the act has considered the domestic and public dimensions of violence separately. "Violence Prevention and Monitoring Centers (VPMC / ŞÖNİM)" have been established in order to secure the effectiveness of the act and develop preventive measures against violence.
2. Within the scope of the 6284 numbered Law, in addition to protective and preventive measures, forced imprisonment application have been introduced. As of May 2014, almost 32 thousand decisions of protective measures, 200 thousand preventive injunctions, and 3231 forced imprisonment decisions have been taken. The forced imprisonment of the offending partners for a period of time is important in terms of deterrence. In October 2012 a pilot project of "electronic support system" launched an application supplying women exposed to violence a “panic button”. But this practice was later abandoned.
3. The 2012-2015 National Action Plan on Combating Violence against Women introduced in July 2012 is an important step taken in the struggle against violence. A pilot study for the formation of “Database of Violence against Women" had been

realized in 2012-2013 and as a result of this study, a model for a database of violence against women was developed. The work to integrate this data to the database currently used within the General Directorate on the Status of Women is in progress.

4. The Regulation about Opening and Operating Women's Guesthouses prepared in coordination with nongovernmental organizations has been put in to operation in January 2013. "Shelters" or "guesthouses" for women exposed to violence has been on the agenda of Turkey for 30 years. The opening of the guesthouse with the Municipal Act 2005 has become a municipality obligation under certain conditions. With the establishment of the Ministry of Family and Social Polices in 2011 there has been a considerable increase in the number of shelters . There are totally 128 shelters for now; 92 connected to General Directorate on the Status of Women, 33 connected to municipalities and 3 connected to nongovernmental organizations. Today all but three provinces have a shelter.
5. The definition of sexual crimes has been expanded with the changes made in the Criminal Code in June 2014 and sanctions against sexual crimes have been aggravated. Misuse of adoptive and foster relations with the authority on the basis of parental relationship has been recognized as a cause of the aggravated situation. Also, aggravated sanctions for honor killings, sexual assault, child sexual abuse, underage sex and sexual harassment were envisaged to the law in question.
6. Training programs for service providers and policy-makers have been performed in order to change the cultural and mindset level of fundamentals about the violence against women. The training programs provided information on The Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW), Istanbul Convention and the 6284 numbered Law. Since 2007 the training of 71 thousand police officers, 65 thousand health officials and 21 thousand clergy have been completed. Additionally, training seminars for Family Court judges and prosecutors were held. A specialised group of educators on domestic violence has been formed within The Police Headquarters in order to serve for a similar purpose.
7. As well as the staff of the Gendarmerie General Command, the General Staff personnel were given training on gender equality and violence against women. Gendarmerie General Command has established Children and Women's Section Chief in 37 provinces with the project that began in July 2013. It is aimed to spread these Section Chiefs to all provinces. Gendarmerie General Command have printed and distributed over 400 thousand qualified informative booklets for women who are victims of violence since 2014²⁰.
8. Awareness raising and informative activities were carried out for Syrian refugees living in camps. In this regard 500 thousand copies of a booklet concerning information about violence against women, age of marriage, civil marriage and women's rights prepared in Turkish and Arabic languages were distributed in provinces where there are camps.
9. The ALO 183 Family, Women, Children, Disabled and Social Service Hotline in service since September 2011 among the Ministry of Family and Social Polices has become an important resource for women exposed to violence. This hotline is available 7 days a week 24 hours a day and provides service in Turkish, Kurdish, and Arabic as well as sign language via 3G. This hotline is recognised by significant number of women²¹.

²⁰https://app1.jandarma.tsk.tr/KYSOP/proje_sitesi/Projemiz-Hakkinda (Accessed: June 24th, 2016).

²¹According to a survey conducted in 2014, 56.3 % of women are aware of the ALO Violence Hotline. Çaha, *Değişen Türkiye'de Kadın (Women in Changing Turkey)*, p. 246.

10. Awareness activities are carried out in order to prevent violence against women in Turkey. Various public service ads were prepared for this purpose. In this context, a public promotion ad with the motto “Violence Against Women is Betrayal of Humanity!” was prepared in 2015, where the promotional programs supported by Prime Minister Recep Tayyip Erdoğan, his wife Emine Erdoğan, and many artists and sportsmen have been involved extensively in the media. The campaigns carried out by nongovernmental organizations also play an important role.
11. “TUBITAK” (Scientific and Technological Research Council of Turkey), taking domestic violence in to the priority issues in 2016, made project calls about the subject. In this context, the amount of support designated for each project has been equivalent to about seven times that of 1001 or similar projects²². Such incentives are of great importance for raising awareness on the subject matter with the help of scientific research.

Ongoing Issues

Despite the aforementioned positive steps violence is still occupying Turkey’s agenda. The ongoing issues about violence or issues where the ongoing works have remained can be summarized as follows:

1. The proportion of women exposed to any kind of violence is at a remarkably high level. According to research carried out by The Women's Status General Directorate and Hacettepe University Institute of Population Studies in 2014; the proportion of women who have suffered from physical violence throughout their life at any time is 36 percent across Turkey. The risk of exposure to violence of women at the age group 15-24 is higher compared to other age groups. Almost half of the women married before the age of 18 have been exposed to violence and one fifth have been exposed to sexual violence²³.
2. It is estimated that the proportion of women having experienced physical or sexual violence is more than reported. The proportion of women who have not reported to any institution on the violence they have been exposed to, is 88.5 percent in urban areas and 92.5 percent in rural areas. 92.9 percent of the women are without a primary level education, and 81.1 percent of women have a university level or higher education do not report to any institution in case they suffer further physical or sexual violence²⁴. Because of this fact it is possible to state that the cases transferred to judicial authorities are actually the tip of the iceberg.
3. There are multidimensional sociological, economic, psychological and cultural causes underlying the attitude of women exposed to violence who do not report to any institution by keeping it secret. Worries about the unhappiness of the child, the risk of remaining unprotected, the possibility of the offender’s increasing the level of violence, and fear of condemnation cause women to keep violence unspoken.
4. A significant increase in the number of violent cases transferred to the authorities in recent years is striking. According to data from the General Directorate of Security,

²²For the text of the call for projects look at: <http://www.tubitak.gov.tr/sites/default/files/1003-sbb-aile-2016-1donem.pdf>

²³Women's Status General Directorate and Hacettepe University Institute of Population Studies, *Türkiye’de Kadına Yönelik Aile İçi Şiddet Araştırması (Research on Domestic Violence against Women in Turkey)*, Ankara, 2015, p. 83. For the online document check below link: <http://www.hips.hacettepe.edu.tr/KKSA-TRAnaRaporKitap26Mart.pdf> (Accessed: April 13th, 2016)

²⁴Ibid.

the number of women admitted to police on the grounds of violence was 45.738 in 2010. However, in 2014 this number rose to 118.14²⁵.

5. The number of women killed in 2010 was 94, and this number increased to 133 in 2014. 23 of the murdered women were protected under "temporary protection measures". Two of the murdered women were killed in the presence of police. In one of these incidents one police officer lost his life. Therefore, the effectiveness of the preventive measures is not satisfactory.
6. As we have mentioned above, among the General Police Headquarters there are police officers receiving educational training in order to educate other police officers about violence against women but their number is still small. In Istanbul, Turkey's most populated city, the number of police experts on domestic violence was around 300 in 2015²⁶.
7. Women going to the police face various problems. At the root of this lies the sexist perspective prevalent among police. In some incidents, police remain insensitive to the woman or directs the woman back to the family where she has been exposed to violence. According to information supplied from women exposed to domestic violence, the statements of 80.3 percent of rural, and 92.7 percent of urban women were not taken by the police. This is another factor preventing women exposed to violence from going to the police for their problems.
8. In cases of violence against women, the police are obliged to direct the case to VPMC (Violence Prevention and Monitoring Centers) serving directly as a single center in order to speed up the process. However, because a direct connection between the police stations and VPMC could not be established, the process could not operate efficiently. The process was extended since the correspondences with VPMC were performed through the Ministry of Family and Social Policies. Additionally, the regulations organizing the operational principles of the VPMCs were delayed and these centers could not serve effectively. The relevant regulation was put into operation in March 2016.
9. Within the scope of the 6284 numbered Law, the duration of the determination of the desired protective and preventive measures of the Family Court may take up to seven days in some cases. This means that women are under risk until the date protective measures are taken. Some of the women's murders were realized within the granting period of protective support²⁷.
10. "Forced imprisonment" of the offender has been predicted as the security element of the decisions taken in preventing domestic violence. However; it is observed that the forced imprisonment decision is not applied widely. The forced imprisonment decision is generally rejected by judges. Notification and announcement to the offender is not compulsory in order to implement forced imprisonment. Despite this, some of the judges demand the notification rule and so sanctions for the offender are hindered.
11. Some troubles about women's shelters strike attention. One of these is the low level of support given to the women staying in shelters . The support provided to the women

²⁵ TBMM, *The Commission Report of the Parliamentary Research Commission on Determination of Necessary Measures through Research on Causes of Violence against Women -Volume I, 2015*. For the online document check below link: [https:// www. tbmm. gov.tr/ sirasayi/donem24/yil01/ss.717-bolum-1.pdf](https://www.tbmm.gov.tr/sirasayi/donem24/yil01/ss.717-bolum-1.pdf) (Accessed: May 15th, 2016).

²⁶ Ayşe Karabat, "Polis Kadına Şiddetle Mücadelede Toplumsal Destek İstiyor (Police Want Community Support in the Struggle of Violence against Women)" For the online document check below link: [http:// www. aljazeera. com.tr/ al-jazeera-ozel/ polis- kadina- siddetle-mucadelede-toplumsal-destek-istiyor](http://www.aljazeera.com.tr/al-jazeera-ozel/polis-kadina-siddetle-mucadelede-toplumsal-destek-istiyor) (Accessed: May 28th, 2016).

²⁷ <http://www.istanbulbarosu.org.tr/images/newss/6284RAPOR112015.pdf> (Accessed: June 18th, 2016)

staying in shelters is about one quarter of the minimum wage. We also note that this support is not provided to all of the women. Because of the strict and rigorous assessments, the proportion of women receiving support remains at considerably low levels. The number of women benefiting from temporary state aid in 2014 was only 214. Women staying in shelters have to change location frequently and therefore they cannot start a job. This situation also prevents the education of the women's children.

12. The services provided and measures taken for the children of the women victims of violence sheltering in shelters are insufficient. Among the main problems for children comes the insufficiency of the day nursery support. For instance, nursery support could only be given to 33 women in 2014. Children staying in shelter houses without day nursery support experience another problem besides exposure to violence (eg lack of education and psychological support).

Action Plans

More advanced policies must be maintained by deepening the ongoing efforts to combat violence against women effectively. In this context it is important that the following steps are taken:

1. A common database has to be established in order to take effective steps in preventing violence against women. It is important that all kinds of information about the offender's are stored and accessible to authorized people. Additionally, an effective and organized coordination and cooperation among the responsible authorities is essential.
2. Most of the women are ashamed of the violence they have been exposed to, they are afraid of sharing their experience, and avoid taking initiative in terms of direct support. Some women even blame themselves for the violence and experience feelings of guilt. Awareness activities directed towards settling the consciousness of victims of violence are not *guilty* but are *victims* should be carried out multi dimensionally. It is important that people witnessing violence, especially health officials, report the issue to authorities. It is necessary that these works are carried out in coordination by the municipalities, nongovernmental organizations and media as well as the responsible public institutions.
3. Most of the women exposed to sexual violence do not know where to apply. Therefore, it is necessary to perform educational campaigns in order to introduce the institutions the victims can access.
4. Undertaking steps towards changing the gender stereotypes in the police force, renewal of the curriculum of police schools considering gender stereotypes, the inclusion of domestic violence in the curriculum, and providing awareness training against domestic violence to current police officers is of great importance. Additionally, increasing the number of functional experts on the subject within police forces would be ideal.
5. Early marriage increases the possibility of women's exposure to domestic violence. Although marriage of children below the age of 15 is a crime (according to the current law) early marriages are still common in our country. Research shows that in some of the marriages below the age of 18 (13%) the age was forged²⁸. In order to prevent this situation, forging the age of girls for marriage should be prevented. Additionally,

²⁸Women's Status General Directorate and Hacettepe University Institute of Population Studies, Türkiye'de Kadına Yönelik Aile İçi Şiddet Araştırması 2014 (Research on Domestic Violence against Women in Turkey 2014).

marriages at young ages are legitimized with religious marriage customs. In marriages under the legal age the imam's consent should not be allowed.

6. According to the laws, judges can give 3-10 days forced imprisonment to violent offenders who do not obey the given suspension decisions. The forced imprisonment can be extended up to 30 days in failure to comply with the injunction decisions. However; it is obvious that often the judges do not apply the forced imprisonment. In order to protect women exposed to violence, the application of the forced imprisonment should be encouraged by using judicial sanctions.
7. Improvements should be made regarding the shelters and the women staying there. The necessary improvements should include the following: Any treatment of women victims of violence coming to the shelter should be made free of charge; for mothers with children, shelters with a separate playground should be opened if possible; vocational training should be given to women at the shelter and they should be given priority in employment.
8. Considering the sheer number of women who are subjected to violence in the population of Turkey it is seen that the women's shelters are insufficient. With the Municipality Act of 2005 the municipalities with a population of 50 thousand and above were obliged to open shelter houses. This act was revised later and the population limit has been increased to 100 thousand. It is necessary that this act should be reinstated so that the municipalities with a population of 50 thousand and above will be obliged to open shelter houses.
9. Women working on minimum wage cannot receive service when they apply for legal aid since they appear as an "income earner". Additionally, due to the insufficiency of the fees paid for legal aid, lawyers are not willing to give "judicial assistance". Therefore, a rearrangement of legal aid, and the encouragement of lawyers in this regard should be provided.
10. In cases of violence against women, judges using "discretion" to impose reductions in punishment is a major problem. In crimes like violence, rape, forced marriage to the rapist, and murders committed with motives like custom and honor, reduction in punishments should not be applied. In cases of violence against women the discretion should be removed.
11. Considering the workload of the Family Courts, *specialised courts* on violence against women that will examine only the violent cases deeply should be established.

VII. WOMEN'S HEALTH

Related Articles: 5, 10, 11, 12, 14, 16

In order to diminish the economic and social pressures due to the increasing population of Turkey in the 1980's, the government laid emphasis on birth control policies. The effects of these were seen during the following years and the rate of fertility in Turkey began to diminish. 2.1 children is the needed rate in a country to renew its population. The total fertility rate in Turkey was 2.37 in 2001 whereas it diminished to 2.14 in 2008. The rate of fertility decreased to a point where the population could not renew itself at the rate of 2,02. Taking into consideration the economic and social problems due to the older populations of developed countries, policies for increasing the population were implemented. As a result of the campaigns carried out and organized, the total rate of fertility started to increase and in 2014, it reached a level of 2,17. The main reason of certain incentives encouraging families to have more children in Turkey the aging population incentive supported by civil society and field experts.

The life spans in Turkey increased to 74,7 in men and 79,2 in women in 2013. It is forecast that the lifespan will be 80,2 for women and 75,8 for men in 2023. Women living longer will risk exposure to health problems due to old age. This matter will be considered in Turkey's agenda during the next few years.

Positive Developments Achieved

Significant steps have been taken during recent years relating to women's health. Some of these steps are as follows:

1. The greatest hazard which girls encounter when they were not even given birth, is terminating a pregnancy due to gender. In Turkey, it is prohibited to select gender with medical intervention and only when gender related hemophilia or some muscle diseases are diagnosed, is the use of Pre-implantation Genetic Diagnosis (PGD) permitted.
2. The most significant problems which women encountered in terms of health is early marriage and pregnancy. The average age for marriage has recently increased. The average age for women to marry was 22,2 in 2001 and increased to 23,6 in 2013²⁹.
3. With the effect of campaigns carried out during recent years, the rate of adolescents (aged between 15-19) giving birth rapidly diminished. The rate of adolescents giving birth was 3,7 percent in 2009 and decreased to 2,8 percent in 2013.
4. As the result of policies against the child bride/child mother issues, the rates of girls aged 15 and younger giving birth was 0,2 percent in 2001 and decreased to zero in 2013.
5. With the effect of the conditional health support provided towards diminishing the children-mothers' deaths, the ratio of women giving births at health institutions reached 95 percent at the start of 2000. The ratio of births of women giving birth at health institutions for ages 20 and younger was 78,6 in 2003 and this was increased to 97,3 in 2013.

²⁹ TÜİK, *Women in Statistics -2015*, Ankara: TÜİK, 2015.

6. As a result of the policies followed towards women living in rural areas, the rates of women living in rural areas giving birth at health institutions increased from 64,3 in 2013 to 91,7.
7. Pre-marital counseling services increased within the scope of mother-child trainings. The number of people who were provided with pre-marital counseling service before 2014 was 123709 and the number of personnel having given the pre-marital counseling service was 3200³⁰.
8. The Ministry of Health is in cooperation with the gendarme so as to raise awareness among women relating to reproductive sexual health and sexually transmitted diseases. In this frame, all privates serving in gendarme are provided with training relating to maternity, family planning and health of the pregnant mother in addition to the subjects written above³¹.
9. A similar training is ongoing at the Ministry of National Education. The Ministry provides trainings on different health matters with an emphasis on reproductive health within the frame of education of mother, father and child.

Ongoing Issues

Despite positive steps taken in the right direction relating to women's health, it is known that there are ongoing problems. The main problems relating to health matters are mainly as follows:

1. Despite the legal regulations being enacted in terms of preventing the marriage of children, there are issues encountered in their implementation. According to the data from 2014, 23,7 percent of girls married when they were aged between 16 and 19³².
2. The social gender templates continue to become an issue in terms of marriages. While society does not tolerate boys being forced to marry at early ages, girls marrying at early ages are encouraged. 15.2 percent of men tolerate girls marrying between ages 15 and 19 and 10,8 of men tolerate girls marrying between ages 15 and 19. However, the rate of people tolerating men aged between 15 and 19 getting married is less than 3 percent.
3. It is understood that many girls who were made to marry at a younger age were forced to be married with elderly men. In some cases, the age differences can be as great as 10 times.
4. Based on the data from 2008, only 46 percent of women aged between 15 and 49 have implemented a method to prevent pregnancy. Based on the data from 2013, the rate of women who use methods to prevent pregnancy is 49 percent, which still may cause unwanted pregnancies to occur³³.
5. The mothers' death rates during pregnancies started to increase in recent years. In 2012, mothers' death rates during birth increased from 15,4 in one hundred thousand, and it increased to 19 in one hundred thousand in 2014. Mothers' death rates in high income countries such as Norway and Denmark are 14.0 in one hundred thousand live births.

³⁰ Ministry of Family and Social Policies, *Administrative Activity Report for the year 2015*

³¹ Ministry of Health, *Activity Report for the year 2015*.

³² TÜİK, *Population Statistics- 2015*, Ankara, TÜİK, 2015.

³³ *Study on Population and Health in Turkey-2008* and *Study on Population and Health in Turkey-2013* http://www.hips.hacettepe.edu.tr/tsa2013/rapor/TNSA_2013_ana_rapor.pdf (Access: 15 Nisan 2016)

6. There are significant gaps between regions of Turkey in terms of deaths of mothers. The rate can be 7.7 in one hundred thousand in the Eastern Marmara Region but may be as high as 32.2 in one hundred thousand in the North Eastern Anatolian Region³⁴.
7. Despite the precautions developed towards diminishing infant deaths in Turkey, the expected rate of decrease in infant deaths were not seen. The infant death rate which was 1,2 percent in 2010 could only be diminished to 11,1 in 2014.
8. A similarly slow decrease is seen among the death rates of children aged younger than five years old. The rates of deaths of children under five years old was 1,34 percent in 2013 and only decreased to 1,33 percent in 2014³⁵.

Action Plans

As expressed above, despite various policies developed and implemented in Turkey, the expected success rate could not be reached in terms of women's health. It can be understood that additional precautions and supplementary policies are needed in the field of women's health.

1. Training towards prevention of unwanted pregnancies should be of importance. This type of training should especially be more widespread among women having married at an early age.
2. The education on reproductive health based on gender and age should be placed in the curriculum of the Ministry of National Education and if possible, be provided at the secondary school levels as well.
3. When providing reproductive and sexual health education, sensitivities and moral values of society should also be considered.
4. Tools for protection against unwanted pregnancies should be provided for poorer women (such as birth control pills).
5. Despite the birth rates of women living in rural areas giving birth at health institutions increasing to 90 percent, this is not enough. With the follow up of pregnancies of poor women in rural areas being scheduled before birth, it is essential that these women should be cared for until their giving birth at places where health institutions are located.
6. The protective follow up of illiterate, poor pregnant women or women who have just given birth should be paid importance to.
7. The scope of the conditional health aid should be expanded and illiterate, poor pregnant women or women who have just given birth should be included in this scope.
8. Women who previously had many births have a higher rate of risk of complications during maternity and birth. This is why women who bear high risk should be provided with efficient birth control training against unwanted pregnancies.
9. The scope of inoculation during infancy and childhood years should be expanded. Special attention should be paid in following up inoculations of infants and children. More care should especially be shown regarding the monitoring of newborn babies and more importance should be paid to the training of the mother.

³⁴ *Annual Health statistics of the General Directorate of Health Researches-2012*. For internet sources, refer to. <http://www.saglik.gov.tr/TR/belge/1-32083/saglik-arastirmalari-genel-mudurlugu-saglik-istatistikl-.html> (Access: July 19, 2016).

³⁵ TÜİK, *Death Statistics-2014* <http://www.tuik.gov.tr/PreHaberBultenleri.do?id=18623> (Access: April 17, 2016)

VIII. REFUGEE WOMEN

Related Articles: 1, 4, 10,11, 16

As a result of the ongoing civil war in Syria, millions of Syrian refugees took shelter in Turkey. Due to being a neighboring border, an “open door” policy ensued. Because of available opportunities for Syrian refugees, Turkey was one of the two countries that attracted the greatest number of refugees. Based on the assumptions made, it is estimated that around three million Syrian refugees currently live in Turkey with 10 percent of them living at camps. Today, Syrian refugees are spread out in nearly all the cities of Turkey.

The basic principle to benefiting from the possibilities that are provided by the Turkish government is to become a registered person. This is the same case applicable for Syrian refugees and immigrants. The government provides registered Syrian refugees the opportunities of education and health. The Law for protecting children numbered 5395 considers the unaccompanied or alone/separated refugees’ children in the same status as Turkish citizens and protects them. Approximately 35 percent of refugees who have taken shelter in Turkey consist of women and 50 percent of them consist of children. Syrian refugee women have to deal with and handle the problems of being women in addition to the issues that the refugees generally encounter.

Positive Developments Achieved

In Turkey, there are many multi-faceted supportive actions taken towards Syrian refugees. Syrians living in camps are under the protection of the Turkish Government. It can be seen that those living inside the camps are safer compared to those living outside the camps. It should also be remembered that there are Syrian people who brought their capital to Turkey and continue to engage in business activities. Some of the positive actions taken towards Syrian refugees are as follows:

1. Under “The Code of Protection of the Foreigners and International Protection” numbered in 6458 adopted in April 2014, unaccompanied children, disabled people, elderly, pregnant persons or mother or father with child or the refugees who were subject to torture, sexual assault or other psychological, physical violence are defined as “people with special needs” and they are covered under protection.
2. Based on the same code, women who were exposed to torture, sexual assault or other psychological and physical violence can be admitted to women’s shelters. The women having been accepted to women’s shelters have the same and equal rights with other women at the shelters.
3. The physical conditions of the camps in Turkey are above average for global camp standards. This reality is one of the reasons that motivate Syrians to come to Turkey.
4. Syrian refugees may have access to health services since 2013. However they have to be registered in order for them to benefit from health services.
5. Based on the research carried out by AFAD (The Disaster and Emergency Management Authority) in 2013, 93.8 percent of the women staying in camps and 57.9 of the women staying outside the camps may benefit from the health services.
6. The health services provided for the women also include birth services. 96.2 percent of the women staying in camps and 97.1 of the women staying outside the camps may give birth at hospitals.

7. In Turkey, it can be seen that benevolent Turkish citizens also support Syrian refugees in addition to the state. Generally the furniture for Syrians at the houses where they stay are provided by such benevolent Turkish people.
8. Approximately 80 percent of the children of school age at the camps go to school. The state ensures that Syrian children can receive education in their own languages.
9. UNDP (United Nations Development Program) and Turkish Legal Bars Union have been carrying out a joint project so as to facilitate the Syrian refugees' access to justice.
10. Foundation of Social Help and Solidarity connected to the Ministry of Family and Social Policies, provides services (like livelihood relief, school relief for kids, and public and financial relief etc.) to refugees as well as Turkish people under the condition that the registered refugees appeal for these services.
11. Turkish Employment Agency (ISKUR) connected to the Ministry of Labour and Social Security provides job seeking and job placement services for registered and appealed refugees to ensure the integration of refugees into economic life and to eliminate exploitation of refugees in the economy.
12. The Ministry of the Interior carries out studies concerning granting Turkish Nationality to refugees to ensure their integration³⁶.

Ongoing Issues

Despite Turkey providing some services and opportunities towards Syrian immigrants, Syrian immigrants staying outside these camps have to take care of themselves. Some have encountered serious issues. Some of the issues encountered at the camps where the Syrian immigrants are can be listed as follows:

1. Only 45% of the women staying outside the camps are registered to AFAD (The Disaster and Emergency Management Authority). Since the remaining have no registration, they cannot effectively benefit from the opportunities granted by Turkey.
2. The schooling and education ratios of refugee children staying outside the camp are low. Based on the research made, the ratio of children outside camps who receive an education is at the rate of 25 percent. The children are predominantly employed as apprentices etc. at various workplaces.
3. It can be seen that Syrian women having taken shelter in Turkey have low socio-economic qualifications. 56.7 percent of the women staying in camps are housewives and 30 percent of them have no jobs whatsoever. Only 4 percent of them have qualified occupations (such as teachers, nurses or midwives).
4. Due to the difficulties in gaining a work permit, many refugees work under very bad conditions and at much lower salaries than if they were legally employed. This also encompasses Syrian refugees who have a high level of education.
5. Many Syrian refugees are unaware of the rights they are given since they cannot be informed of the Turkish laws and regulations.
6. Many Syrian women and girls are afraid to talk about the physical and sexual harassment they were exposed to. Language is just one of the reasons that prevent them from expressing themselves.
7. Despite the fact that there are no precautions against refugee women to benefit from the available practices and institutions, due to personnel working in such institutions lacking sufficient information and sensitivity, the services may be neglected.

³⁶ *Yenişafak Daily Journal*, Suriyeli Mültecilere Vatandaşlık Müjdesi (Good News for Syrian Refugees), <http://www.yenisafak.com/gundem/suriyeli-multecilere-vatandaslik-mujdesi-2489915>, (Accessed: July 2, 2016)

8. One of the most important issues that Syrians living outside camps encounter is the housing problem. Many Syrians have to reside in houses and domiciles which do not bear the characteristics of a proper house. It is widely spread knowledge that more than one family shares the same house for dwelling.
9. The needs of refugee women and girls are very different compared to male refugees. Refugee women feel more intensely the effects of issues such as minimum hygiene, cleaning and care.
10. The women staying outside the camp areas cannot benefit from the health services unless it is deemed as essential. The women outside the camps very rarely benefit from protective and preventative health activities such as pregnancy monitoring and inoculation of the children³⁷.
11. It can be seen that Syrian women and girls face the pressure of short-term marriages and prostitution. This is more widespread, especially in the cities closer to the border areas. It can be seen that in these areas, very young Syrian girls (aged between 15 and 18) are married with men as their second and third wives. In cities near the borders, a sector is organized where young girls and women are brought from Syria for marriage.
12. Due to the pressures and living conditions that the refugee women were subject to, they have a higher risk of being exposed to mental and psychological diseases. Their need for psychological support is greater. Based on the research conducted by AFAD (The Disaster and Emergency Management Authority), approximately 52 percent of the Syrian women need psychological support³⁸.

Action Plans

1. First of all, more research needs to be carried out regarding the Syrian women and children in Turkey. There is research conducted on the effects of immigrants on the social and economic indicators in Turkey, yet they are insufficient. Studies are especially needed so as to analyze their effect on the business and labour markets.
2. There is a widespread and dominant opinion that Syrian immigrants are a burden for Turkey. This feeds the negative approach and viewpoint towards the Syrian people. However, there are many Syrians having transferred their capital into Turkey and having established businesses. By revealing this with research, the effect of the Syrians on Turkey should be determined in all aspects.
3. The psychological counseling services and rehabilitation activities towards refugee or immigrant women should be increased. Campaigns should be organized in this respect towards obtaining support from NGOs and volunteers.
4. Language courses should be given for refugee women and children. Syrian women encounter various problems due to the language barrier.
5. In the cities where Syrian immigrants are populated, informative brochures and public notifications should be issued and developed, and awareness activities should be carried out towards the Syrians and Turkish people.
6. Rehabilitation and adaptation studies should be made towards maintaining and ensuring the immigrants' adaptation to Turkey and overcoming immigration traumas.

³⁷ Mazlumder, *The Report on the Female Syrian Refugees Living Outside Camps, 2014*. For internet sources, refer to: <http://mazlumder.org> (Accessed: June 23, 2016).

³⁸ AFAD, *Syrian Reports*, <https://www.afad.gov.tr/tr/IcerikDetay1.aspx?ID=16> (Accessed: June 20, 2016).

Such activities should also be carried out by NGOs and volunteers in addition to the state.

7. The protective and preventative actions towards the women living outside the camps need to be increased. Such precautions are important in terms of preventing women being abused. Otherwise, some social injustices that cannot be stopped may be encountered.
8. Activities such as training courses, occupational trainings, employment, learning Turkish, and awareness for reaching justice should be improved. These studies can be made by way of various training courses and seminars.

IX. DISABLED WOMEN

Related Articles: 2, 4,10,11, 12a

The Constitution renders equality for all in Turkey. The following contains amendments on discrimination from Article 10 of the Constitution. The article pertains to principles of equality amongst the elderly, children, disabled citizens, disabled veterans and widows and orphans. The Constitution, as well as the Disabilities Act (no. 5378) state that those who are disabled maintain the same rights and freedoms of non-handicapped citizens. The law prohibits both direct and indirect discrimination. The law states that independent lives be made accessible by those with disabilities. The subject of independent living was emphasized by the changes to the Disabilities Act in 2014.

Some circumstances prevent equal opportunity to disabled citizens. The primary problem faced by the disabled is accessibility. In urban centers, many are deprived of public services due to the inappropriate design of public service transport vehicles , gardens , parks, and roads. According to TUIK (Turkish Statistical Institute) verifications, 1.4 percent of people are visually impaired, 1.1 percent are hearing impaired. 7 percent are speech impaired, 3.3 percent orthopedically impaired and 2.2 percent are mentally impaired, which account for an average of 9 percent of the total population.

Positive Developments Achieved

The government is working to make some improvements relating to disability care. Improvements are seen in areas of space design according to specific disabilities , employment priority, and social assistance. Some positive improvements are:

1. Descriptive language is changing: "Disability" is used instead of the word "Disabled". In 2013, the language of law changed from "the disabled law" to the "disability act".
2. In 2002, around 52 percent of mental , speech, hearing, visual, and orthopedic disability patients and around 36 percent of patients with chronic diseases had no social security benefit. In the same year, disabled women lacked adequate healthcare accessibility. For example, 42.6 percent of orthopedic patients were not treated . According to a similar example; The same situation was noted on visual and mental disabilities. In 2012, health care costs related to disabled patients began to be covered by the Government in the context of General Health Insurance numbered 5510.
3. The Government pays an amount to families or caretakers of disabled patients. The government pays 258 Turkish Lira to disabled people who have 70 percent of disability rate and 305 Turkish Lira to disabled people who have disability rate of 40-69 percent as maintenance fee. The government also pays 305 TL to the families of disabled people who are under the age of 18.
4. The number of home care services has increased from 30638 in 2007 to 469305 in 2016. Similarly, the number of disabled people who benefit from the official care services in 2002 rose from 1943 in 2006 to 7327 people.
5. According to act 4857 in business law, Article 30 titled "Obligation for Disabled or Old Convict" at a working place obligates the hiring of workers aged older than 50 are also obligated to have a 3 percent workforce comprised of disabled employees.
6. Similar requirements also apply to the Civil Servants Law No. 657 in the context of employing agency staff. 3 percent of hired civil servants must be disabled

7. In order to simplify disabled applicants entry into labour markets, various arrangements and incentives were given on behalf of Positive Discrimination.
8. According to 30/6 article of Business Law enacted in 2014 February, Mandatory insurance bonuses paid by the Treasury are obligatory for employees as well as employers.
9. No. 6111 issued in February 2011 "Restructuring of some receivables" staff have been encouraged to be run by the private sector. Although there is no required quota of disabled run businesses, half of employer made premiums would be paid by the Treasury.

Ongoing Issues

Although there are some known improvements, serious problems still exist. Some of the problems are:

1. There appears to be a negative perception of idioms and proverbs when describing disabled people in Turkey. For example, " when a Bald man dies, he becomes hairy, when a blind man dies he becomes almond eyed", "Blind horse, blind customer" are just a few cultural expressions underlying disregard for the reality of the disability.
2. There are remarkable differences in labour force among women with disabilities. According to verifications in 2011, while the rate for disabled men in the labour force was 32.2 percent, the rate of women was 6.7. While the rate for unemployed disabled men was 14.6, the rate for women was 21.5.
3. According to data from 2011, illiteracy among the disabled is 23.3 percent -while 10.9 percent of disabled men are illiterate, 32.4 percent of disabled women are illiterate. At least one barrier is higher education: graduates with disabilities are 4 percent for men, and 1.5 percent in women.
4. Negative approach towards the disabled is an issue in the Social Community: 70 percent of community members find disabled neighbors undesirable.
5. The rate of those who do not work with disabled people are also quite high. For example, a disabled employee was the Director of Social Services and Child Protection Agency, and the staff did not want to work with him. It was stated they felt uncomfortable taking orders from him.
6. Article 15 of the Disabilities Act No. 5378 " Disabilities education cannot be obstructed without reason". Disabled children, young people and adults, taking into account the special circumstances and differences, are provided equal educational opportunities in an integrated environment. Unfortunately, there is no possibility yet for all disabled children to get an education.
7. Despite 10 percent of all students in preschool and kindergarten being handicapped, the creation of a special education system has not been successful.
8. Although a public announcement was officially circulated, there are still low levels of disabled employees working in the public sector. In The Ministry of Education, which holds one of the larger number of public employees, between 2003 and 2009 disabled staff was hired at a mere 0.36 percent.
9. The squads in Social Institutions for disabled employees were not completed by the Managers. Meanwhile , According to verifications in May 2016; 21040 quota of 64191 is empty in Disabled Institutions.
10. Both public and private sectors in proportion to their liabilities observed impaired operation. The number of disabled people who applied to "ISKUR (Turkish Employment Agency)" was 77632 in 2014. Only 232 of them were placed in Public Institutions and 26118 were placed in private sectors.

11. A blatant gender discrimination is seen in disabled employment particularly in the Public sector. According to data from 2016; only 23% of disabled employees are women in the Public Sector .
12. A large portion of municipal buses in Turkey are not available to use for people with disabilities. Despite the accession process of public transport services in the EU in July 2012, full accessibility has not been completely provided as of 2016.

Action Plans

1. Some steps must be taken to provide equal terms and measures for those with disabilities to participate in standard social life. They are mentioned as follows:
2. Despite positive developments in law, negative attitudes and perceptions towards people with disabilities in society, while slowly beginning to change is still ongoing. Therefore, consideration should be given to awareness activities. Disability is not a lack of ideas but is a physiological feature and must be addressed by the community.
3. Educational barriers must be removed. The primary step is to provide adequate accessibility to buildings and classes for those with disabilities.
4. Eligible staff must be available. The number of eligible staff must be increased.
5. The measures must be taken to increase the employment of persons with disabilities. In order to serve this purpose, Law No. 5378 should be able to choose the profession of persons with disabilities as provided under Article 13 and it is necessary to take measures to be able to receive training for this profession.
6. Managers are the reason for obstructing disabled employment in the Public Sector. Managers should be educated and trained for sensitivity and awareness and also be provided improvements in sensibility and empathy.
7. The most important difficulty with accessibility in Turkey, is the reluctance to oversee the law enacted. The solution is to raise awareness between employee and employer.